

**PRSPs and Donor Country Strategies:
Do they add up to effective aid?**
*Analysis of the role of PRSPs in four CIDA
core countries in Africa*

World Vision Partners

Research Team:

Kathy Vandergrift, Canada
Wendy Phillips, Canada
Richard Rugemalira, Tanzania
Annamarie K. Kiaga, Tanzania
Jaime Chivite, Mozambique
Alcino Moiane, Mozambique
Aklilu Dogisso, Ethiopia
Mansour Fall, Senegal

December 2004

Contents

I.	Introduction	2
II.	Governance	2
	Recommendations	6
III.	Education	9
	Recommendations	11
IV.	Economic well being of the poor	14
	Agriculture with recommendations	15
	Liberalization with recommendations	17
	Privatization with recommendations	18
V.	Conclusion	19
VI.	Bibliography	20
VII.	Appendices	22
	A. Methodology	22
	B. Initial Research Questionnaire	23
	C. Tanzania's PRSP and Education: People's Participation and Increased Quality	25
	D. Case Study: Education and PRSP in Manjacaze, Mozambique	35

Introduction

The quest for poverty reduction strategies that effectively change the daily lives of the poor is a daunting but urgent task. Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) were introduced by the World Bank as a vehicle to help accomplish this mission. Many donors, including the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), have agreed to coordinate their aid through the PRSP to prevent financing gaps and maximize efficiency.

As a contribution to Canada's international policy review, World Vision (WV) has undertaken to examine the impact of PRSPs in four of CIDA's core countries: Ethiopia, Mozambique, Senegal and Tanzania. In each of these countries, national WV staff members have been heavily involved in the PRSP process. Based on their experience, three core areas emerged as indicative of the impact of PRSPs: governance, education, and the economic well being of the poor. Gender concerns also emerged as an important theme in each of these areas.

In governance, the effectiveness of the PRSP relies on the ability of a national government strategy to translate into programs and initiatives that are effective at the community level. Consistently, across all four countries, there is a lack of connectivity between national initiatives and local situations, resulting in shortcomings in accountability and effectiveness of specific initiatives.

Education is an area that has been highlighted in each of the countries as one of great improvement. As such, it is important to examine the components that have led to success as well as the next steps necessary to maintain and build on this achievement. In each of the countries, the critical challenge facing education is assuring quality while expanding the reach of educational programs. Another key area for attention is addressing the barriers that continue to face girls and women in order to ensure that they are included in the general gains made in education.

Poverty reduction is not simply about social expenditures in health and education. It is also essential to improve the economic stability and well being of the poor. A critical challenge under the rubric of the PRSP is ensuring that improvements in macro level economic indicators such as GNP, inflation rates, etc., translate into benefits for the poor. Early evidence from the PRSPs confirms the fears raised by many civil society organizations: the privatization /liberalization agenda that under girds the PRSPs often has negative impacts for poverty reduction. Furthermore, in several cases, governments seem to be ignoring the evidence and the demands of their people to address these issues. Not only does this point to problems in governance; it also puts at risk the gains made through education. If education does not translate into sustainable employment, the fruit of poverty reduction will not materialize.

Governance

Monitoring and evaluation (M&E) of the PRSP is a built in component of the process. International Financial Institutions (IFIs), donors, non-governmental organizations and community groups each have expectations that the M&E process will increase accountability and

help ensure funds are being spent effectively. At the conceptual level, community report cards and other methodologies were envisaged as means for communities, the primary beneficiaries of the PRSP, to hold governments accountable for the programs implemented. The reality in all four countries suggests that much remains to be done to improve accountability and transparency of PRSP implementation.

Transparency

At the national level, transparency, access to information, and space for participation is often limited. In Senegal the PRSP is supposed to be implemented through the work of a cross-sector committee. It is commonly perceived, however, that the ministries represented are only concerned with the interests of their particular sector, rather than forging a unified, coherent strategy for reducing poverty. More importantly, there are no tools for monitoring and evaluation at the community level. Taken together, these two factors work against effective monitoring and evaluation of the PRSP by civil society.

In Tanzania, there is a lack of civil society involvement in the development of guidelines and tracking of public expenditures. Although global expenditure figures are available, specific information on particular communities is withheld. "When I go to the government and ask how much money they have spent on health, they can tell me. But when I ask how much has been spent and on what in my community, they won't tell me. When the government is secretive, doubts emerge about the impact of the PRSP" (survey respondent). There is a critical need for information to be available in an easily understandable form and broadly circulated.

The problems are similar in Ethiopia. When asked about the impact of the PRSP, respondents indicated that it was difficult to assess impact in various areas because of a lack of openness on the part of the government. Neither communities nor groups working with the poor were consulted in the latest Annual Progress Report (APR). When non-governmental organizations (NGOs) reviewed the APR, they found numerous inconsistencies in what was reported, and significant omissions. Furthermore, progress data that was made available is aggregated in some sectors. As the NGOs reviewing the document pointed out, aggregation obscures important variations and differences between populations. Finally, the populations were not consulted in determining impacts of the PRSP; thus it is difficult to say whether the PRSP is improving the well being of the poor in the eyes of those most affected by it.

Participation and Administration

A critical challenge for PRSPs is administration and accountability at the local level. In Senegal there is a lack of awareness and involvement of people in the PRSP process at the community level. At the national level some civil society groups are actively involved in highly politicized debates with the government over the PRSP. Different factions of civil society engage in intense debates about priorities and strategic direction. Although this engagement is valuable, it is not a substitute for direct engagement with the poor directly affected by PRSP.

There is a need to link the knowledge and analytical capacity of national level civil society organizations with the field experience of community-based organizations and development NGOs working in poor communities in order to spread awareness of the PRSP and foster participation in monitoring and evaluation of specific elements of the PRSP.

In Mozambique and Tanzania, civil society groups reported a lack of accountability and responsiveness in PRSP programs at the community level. PRSP initiatives are top down and often do not respond to the conditions of local situations. When NGO's and community groups turn to local governments to monitor progress on PRSP programming in their communities, they find that often the government is unaware and uninformed. In both countries local governments remain largely outside the PRSP process. In Mozambique, the PRSP is officially linked to the state government rather than local governments. In Tanzania, a plan for decentralization exists, but there is little political interest in its implementation. Thus involvement at the local level is highly uneven.

In Ethiopia where the PRSP process is officially being decentralized through district level governments, NGOs raise concerns about the capacity to carry out the PRSP. One NGO dealing particularly with health issues, for example, stated that, although it was supportive of the idea of decentralizing expenditures to the Woreda level, there were risks because the "technical capacity at the Woreda level is still very limited... Many people in the health sector fear that health may not receive due attention from Woreda leaders if they set their priorities differently..."

While decentralization of PRSPs can increase responsiveness, there are also risks associated with it. First, decentralization policies can shift responsibility downward and tend to let national governments abdicate responsibility for key sectors in poverty reduction. Secondly, standards and services may become uneven across the country. Third, program design and quality, as alluded to in the Ethiopian example above, are determined by the particular interests of regional governing authorities; there is no automatic guarantee they will be more responsive to community needs. Fourth, in developing country contexts, the capacity of local and regional government needs significant strengthening in the areas of administration and programming knowledge.

Whatever level of government is responsible for PRSP implementation, there is a clear need to increase the avenues for participation and accountability at the local level. Communities can not simply be viewed as vehicles to make sure the PRSP money is being spent as previously decided: they must have an active role in determining what form social and economic inputs will take in their area and how they will be administered. Mechanisms to shift, tailor, and report ineffective programs must also be in place. As one respondent expressed it, "Poor people should not be seen as beneficiaries of government programs or consumers but active citizens, collaborators and joint actors. People should be empowered through enhancement of capabilities in order to influence, engage and hold accountable the institutions with which they interact."

Ownership

In the past it was argued that the interests of the IFIs and other international donors drove the development agenda. Work done by international NGOs was deemed to be dictated by the mandate of the organization rather than by the affected people. One of the goals of the PRSP was to establish local ownership of development initiatives: from the national level down to the community level.

Now, several years into the PRSP process in each of these countries, when in-country development partners were asked about the role of donors, it was consistently suggested that donors use their influence with developing country governments to push for greater transparency with the citizenry, for willingness to listen to its own public, and for mechanisms to

make the PRSP more responsive to local needs. Although there may be a place for donors to encourage governments, what is striking about these responses is that donors are perceived by civil society as having more influence over development directions than the people do. What is also clear is that civil society groups want to have ownership in development initiatives, but as yet, ownership is elusive.

This situation presents a challenge for donors. It is clear that, despite the advent of PRSPs, donors still have considerable influence over developing country governments. Where these governments remain closed to important components of poverty reduction such as democratic participation or gender issues or where the government fails to respond to the advocacy initiatives of its people, donors may need to use their influence. However, if donors are truly committed to country ownership then the critical question becomes how to manage their influence in order to reinforce the capacity of in-country citizens to hold their governments accountable rather than to undermine it.

There are two options to adjust CIDA's current approach under *Strengthening Aid Effectiveness* to address this matter. At present CIDA's approach to governance in the core country strategies gives high priority and almost exclusive attention to strengthening the technical capacity of government departments in certain sectors and financial accountability. This approach by itself is unlikely to encourage in-country transparency without the kind of intrusion that contradicts the principle of local ownership. If, however, equal or greater attention were given to enabling the citizenry in developing countries to participate actively and hold their own governments accountable for poverty reduction strategies, the long-term goal of local ownership might be reached. While donor agencies should be reluctant to intervene directly between governments and their citizens, it is possible to provide resources for partnerships between civil society organizations themselves, including international networks committed to poverty reduction, to assist in building genuine accountability into PRSP implementation.

There is increasing recognition within the IFIs that parliaments and elected representatives need to play a greater role in the development and implementation of PRSPs. Fear of interference in political affairs has been cited as a reason for reluctance to actively support such initiatives in the past. This argument is based on a false dichotomy that views technical assistance to government departments as apolitical, while parliamentary engagement is considered too political. Good governance, now one of the top priorities on the development agenda, cannot be achieved through technical assistance at the departmental level alone. One option for resolving this dilemma is to support initiatives that enhance democratic processes, such as citizen engagement with their parliamentarians on PRSP priorities, without interfering in the substance of the dialogue. Evidence from these four countries indicates that strengthening democratic processes would, in fact, be less political interference than the current practice of influencing decisions through department officials without public accountability.

The second mechanism available to donors is greater incorporation of human rights into the PRSP process. Existing international human rights conventions put people at the centre and recognize both the dignity and agency of poor and vulnerable people to participate in their own development. The conventions on economic and social rights address many of the factors covered in a typical PRSP. They also provide a common basis between donor and developing countries, since, in most cases, developing countries and developed countries have adopted the same instruments, designed to respect, promote, and protect fundamental rights of people. If PRSPs took into account the human rights commitments of developing country governments,

donors, and the international community in general, they would strengthen the role of affected peoples, which is essential for poverty reduction.

In keeping with Canada's leadership on the rights of children, it is worth considering the role that the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) might play, because in each of these countries, over 50 per cent of the population are under the age of 18. The CRC in particular provides a holistic framework for development and contains provisions for progressive realization, which encourages continuous progress without creating unrealistic expectations. While the mechanisms for accountability are very weak, implementation should be strengthened through the recent adoption of an international strategy, entitled *A World Fit for Children*, and national action plans with more specific targets and goals. Specific reference is made to including the goals of the Plan of Action into Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (*A World Fit for Children*, p. 59) and a commitment is made to "build community capacity for monitoring, assessment, and planning." (*A World Fit for Children*, p.60.) Canada's National Action Plan, approved by Cabinet in April, 2004, includes international commitments under each of the major themes: strengthening communities, promoting healthy lives, protecting from harm, and promoting education and learning, and commits Canada to a rights-based approach in working with children.

Consistency is needed between commitments made to children of the world in documents like *A World Fit for Children*, and PRSPs, one of the major instruments for achieving progressive realization of many of those commitments. Recent research by Kindernothilfe, a German NGO, however, documents that very few PRSPs take into account the rights of children, including working children. (Heidel, *Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers – blind to the rights of the (working) child?*, 2004) This is essential for poverty reduction in any country where children make up over 50 percent of the population. One of their recommendations is that both IFIs and donor agencies implement a human rights approach to PRSP processes in order to achieve the objective of ownership. Research done by World Vision and reported in *Doing the Rights Thing* showed how a rights-based approach to education, as one example, could help to achieve the goals of poverty reduction.

Recommendations

General

1. As part of a coherent approach to foreign policy that recognizes the importance of responsible, democratic governance, Canada should use its membership on the boards of the World Bank and IMF to press for substantive change in the PRSP process to allow much greater space for civil society participation, an enhanced role for parliaments and elected representatives in the PRSP process, flexibility in conditions imposed by the IFIs, and higher priority to responsiveness to the needs of local communities within the country than to compliance with World Bank economic prescriptions.
2. As a reflection of the priority Canada puts on inclusion and respect for human rights, Canada should show leadership in an international movement to require IFIs to take into consideration commitments countries have made to international human rights conventions, and include progressive realization as part of good governance in a democratic society.
3. In keeping with Canada's leadership on child rights, Canada should work with other countries to develop impact assessment tools, implementation strategies, and monitoring

measures to ensure that the rights of children receive adequate attention in PRSPs, especially in countries where children are a large percentage of the population and a large percentage of those affected by poverty.

4. To encourage transparency, accountability to the citizenry of developing countries, and responsiveness to the needs of affected populations, CIDA should give greater priority to civil society accountability mechanisms in its country development frameworks, including a shift of resources from budgetary support to support for civil society initiatives in PRSP processes and civil society/government dialogues on transparency and responsiveness to local conditions.
5. Civil society organizations, especially international networks of development NGOs, should give greater attention to active participation in the monitoring, review, and revision of PRSPs, as well as implementing PRSP-funded projects. To achieve this, resource allocations for program implementation will need to include resources for monitoring, analysis, and dialogue with authorities on policy and program implementation.

Country Specific Recommendations

Mozambique

- CIDA could consider lending support to NGO/government discussions on decentralization and other mechanisms to increase local responsiveness of the PRSP.
- CIDA should continue to pursue its commitment to strengthening both government and non-government mechanisms necessary to increase accountability and effectiveness of the PRSP.

Senegal

- CIDA should support Senegalese government initiatives to put in place a monitoring tool that can be used by civil society.
- CIDA could support government and civil society initiatives to increase awareness of the PRSP at the grassroots level.

Tanzania

- CIDA could encourage the government to pursue a higher level of transparency and specificity with respect to public expenditures.
- Through co-operation with Canadian NGOs and their partners in Tanzania, CIDA could also reinforce the capacity of Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) and district level governments to disseminate and educate people about PRSP initiatives specific to their area.

Ethiopia

- CIDA should support NGO/government initiatives to increase capacity at the Woreda level and improvements in the transparency of monitoring and evaluation of the PRSP.
- To encourage more openness in Ethiopia, CIDA should continue and expand support for initiatives to increase the capacity of civil society organizations in Ethiopia to engage with the government and work for greater participation in PRSP processes as well as specific project implementation.

Case Study: Education and Poverty Reduction in Tanga, Tanzania

Like many of his peers, Ramadhani attended Gendagenda primary school in Handeni district, Tanga region, in Tanzania, for seven years, hoping to gain the privilege and opportunity that education offers. When asked how primary education has helped him, however, he genuinely replied, "It has not helped me at all." The curiosity of those sitting in the makeshift house that Gendagenda villagers call a dispensary was aroused, talking to this well-built man in shattered clothing, with no shoes on, but with eyes shining with hope for the future. This is part of his testimony:

"The school had three classrooms and only one teacher. We would go to school around ten o'clock, which is after we had been to the family farm for at least four hours. The teacher usually came in at the same time because he had to attend to his own shamba too... Two classes shared the same classroom at the same time. For example, when I was in grade six, I remember, there were second graders in our class. When the teacher was teaching them (2nd graders), we stayed inside...mostly because even we did not feel any more knowledgeable than them... I don't remember how many people in my class knew how to write. I definitely learned to write after I finished school...out of my own initiatives... because I wanted to do business... Only the teacher had books... There were about 20 students in each class...sometimes only five pupils came to class..."

Ramadhani graduated in 1984. Since then tangible improvements have taken place in his former school. Through the Primary Education Development Plan (PEDP) five classrooms have been built in the last two years and the number of teachers has increased from one to four. Enrollments for Standard One have increased from 30 in 2003 to 90 in 2004. Efforts are underway to make textbooks and reference books available to all the students.

One student from a total of 17 who sat for the Standard VII school leaving certificate examination passed, but he was not selected for secondary education. These are meager changes when compared to two other schools in the same district, located in more 'urban' areas. In Mzundu school, for example, 12 students were selected to join the nearby secondary school. In Mumbwi, 5 of the nine who passed their exams were selected for secondary education. While the improvements are appreciated, local residents realize that more will be needed to achieve the goals of poverty reduction through education.

The Chairperson of the local school committee describes the situation today:

"It is unfortunate that all these changes have limited impact on the questions of school attendance and the poverty lived and experienced on a daily basis by the local people. Although more villagers participate in enhancing school attendance, they are challenged with difficult food production conditions and a lack of income generating activities, such that every chance they get they would let their kids participate in these activities rather than school. Both male and female students are disadvantaged in this respect. In fact, this is why provision of lunch meals has so far failed...six and seven year olds from two neighboring villages stay hungry for long hours ...satellite schools? Where are the teachers?"

A look around the village explains this sobering fact. Located 27 kilometers from the main road, Gendagenda is strategically placed at a railway station yard. The train is the only formal means of accessing the village. The yard is now closed for lack of income generation and the twenty-one railway workers, who happen to be the only salary-earning individuals in the village, apart from the four teachers, are in the process of moving to other stations. The only road that could take you to the village ends at Mgambo army camp. Thereafter, one has to cross thick grasses, on foot or by bicycle, to reach the village. This predicament partly explains the lack of income generating activities in the village. To villagers in Gendagenda, therefore, the value of education is as high as the extent to which it has the potential to change the reality of their livelihoods.

When asked for their suggestions, community leaders identified elements within the education sector, such as curriculum that addresses life skills and social status, improved training and living conditions for teachers, and more secondary schools. Community involvement in the education program was seen as essential to change social attitudes that prevent girls from completing their education. They also named the need for improvements in education to be linked to local economic opportunities to improve livelihoods.

The need was well-expressed by Ramadhini:

"I need skills for agricultural production and entrepreneurship in these harsh conditions. If they are lucky, our children will do better than us. Until then, they need to master these surroundings."

A more holistic approach to poverty reduction is needed to ensure that the children attending school today have a better assessment of the role of education in poverty reduction than Ramadhini has, when they become community decision-makers.

For a detailed analysis of the research and recommendations, see appendix C.

Education

PRSPs recognize that social expenditures in areas such as education and health are important to poverty reduction. In each of the countries under study, education was made a priority area. Governments abolished existing school fees at the primary level, provided free books, and increased teacher training. Schools were built and more teachers hired. The result was expanded enrolment.

Table 1: Gains and Challenges for Improving Education

Country	Education Expenditures (selected list)	Cited Improvements	Areas for Improvement
Mozambique	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Free access to education (rural and urban) Free provision of scholastic material Upgrade training for teachers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved illiteracy rates: 57.7% (2002) to 42% (current). Rise in gross enrolment 56.9% (1995) to 99.5% (2001) in EP1 Increased enrolment in EP 2: 28% (2001) to 31.2% (2002). Girls Enrolment in EP1 increased 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cultural barriers faced by girls leading to high drop out rates Ensuring good quality education

		41.8% (2001) to 43.9% (2002)	
Tanzania	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Teacher recruitment School fees eliminated Class room construction Lunchtime meal provision 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Net enrolment increased: 58.8% (1990) to 85% (2002). Gender parity at primary and 85% at secondary level Increased transition from primary to secondary: 15% in 2000 to 19.5% in 2001 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increased strain on quality of education Pass rate for standard 7 only increased from 20% (2000) to 22% (2002): well below target of 50% Curriculum not yet gender appropriate High drop out rate for girls
Ethiopia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Teacher training Curriculum improvements 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increased enrolment from 8.1 million (2001) to 8.7 million (2002) Benefits spread equally between boys and girls 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Report omits drop out rates which are known to be high Lack of capacity at Woreda level impeding implementation of reforms
Senegal	<i>Progress report not yet available.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increased enrolment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Problems with quality assurance

Increasing the number of children in school has placed a strain on the quality of education. The progress report on the PARPA for Mozambique acknowledges that access has increased, but “recent activities to strengthen the quality of education do not seem to have had a significant effect yet.” This fact is reflected in the lack of improvements in pass rates. In Senegal, a coalition of NGOs, including Transparency International, has taken issue with the government’s education plan, arguing that quality issues are not being addressed.

Mozambique may provide a model for addressing quality issues. In some areas of the country, community groups have been set up to work with local school boards. Together, the board and parents work on issues including community priorities for education, corruption, sexual abuse of children, and concerns about teachers. Deeper, more systemic problems such as chronic hunger that compromise the ability of children to learn must still be addressed.

Addressing gender concerns in education is another critical area. Although gains have been made in the initial enrolment of girls, this does not address cultural barriers that often deter girls from staying in school. WV Mozambique believes government initiatives such as providing free scholarships to girls up to the secondary level are a step in the right direction to encourage girls to stay in school. More needs to be done, however, to address the deeper beliefs and values that curtail the education of women in Mozambique, as well as in Tanzania and Ethiopia. This can best be addressed through civil society organizations working within communities.

Partnerships with NGOs and community-based organizations provide a forum to develop models of best practice. They help establish means to work within communities to assure quality education and address gender issues. The example of community groups in Mozambique could be replicated in other countries through small-scale initiatives that are tailored to address community needs. This is particularly true when dealing with gender issues: cultural perceptions of women often vary from tribe to tribe and require a nuanced understanding to address these concerns. At the same time, NGO/CSO projects should not be stand-alone projects, but should be integrated with other elements of PRSP implementation and should be replicable in other areas.

Governments like Mozambique and Tanzania have stated in their APRs that quality and gender are concerns and have noted their lack of capacity to deal with these. Thus there is space for CIDA and other donors to work together with the governments to identify NGOs and community organizations that could help to develop models of best practice.

Another challenge in maintaining gains in education will be addressing weaknesses in governance that affect program implementation. In Senegal, the lack of a monitoring and evaluation tool impedes the evaluation of the effectiveness of education interventions. Furthermore, it is reported that many civil society organizations are disillusioned by the fact that IFIs continue to be heavily involved in economic areas of PRSP implementation such as the privatization of Senelec (the state owned electricity company) but do not show equal concern for progress in social sectors like education. This creates the perception that the PRSP is not about a holistic approach to poverty reduction but rather the continuance of traditional structural adjustment policies under a new name.

In Ethiopia, the failure of the government to report drop out rates when reporting successes in education is symptomatic of the lack of transparency. According to civil society sources, there is a considerable problem with dropouts; yet these figures do not appear in the progress reports. These omissions skew perceptions of success, and when they are discovered, they do not inspire confidence in the government or its programs.

The government of Ethiopia notes that one of the impediments to implementing its educational reforms is a lack of capacity at the Woreda level. To address this shortcoming, the government is working with donors to build capacity.

Recommendations

General

1. Space should be created within CIDA country development frameworks to address issues that may fall outside the pillars of the PRSPs, such as gender issues within a particular sector. Cooperation with civil society organizations within the country and through international partnerships could be effective strategies to address issues of capacity building, quality, and relevance of education to the community's needs. Such initiatives should include an emphasis on liaising with relevant local government officials so that they are seen as within rather than outside the PRSP, as well as to help ensure their sustainability. These measures are necessary to help ensure that PRSP programs are responsive to the needs of particular communities. Furthermore, these initiatives will help provide models of good practice that can be replicated and mainstreamed to address more complex issues.
2. Funding allocations to support civil society initiatives within designated sectors should be incorporated in the country strategies.

Country Specific Recommendations

Mozambique

- CIDA should continue its emphasis on a blend of program and project work in Mozambique.
- CIDA could support the expansion of community-based groups working to ensure quality education. These community groups could become forums for addressing barriers to girls' education as well as systemic problems that affect education, such as hunger and wasting.

- CIDA should support initiatives by NGOs and Community Based Organizations (CBOs) to develop models of good practice in addressing gender issues in education, including curriculum and societal pressures.

Senegal

- CIDA should work together with the government, other donors and civil society to remove the barriers to effective monitoring of education programming at the community level.

Tanzania

- CIDA could pursue partnerships with CSOs/NGOs to examine the causes of poor pass rates and develop new initiatives to address this problem. The goal would be to replicate these successes in other areas.

Ethiopia

- To assist in building capacity at the Woreda level, CIDA could consider replicating the approach it has taken in Mozambique: namely, where a lack of capacity exists, NGOs/CSOs step in as temporary service providers with the understanding that these endeavours are integrated with the already stated goals of the PRSP. This approach would not undermine state driven development while simultaneously addressing service provision issues.

Case Study: Education and PRSP in Manjacaze, Mozambique

Introduction

Ask the students in Manjacaze what they would like to see improved in their school, and they talk about basic things, like desks and trained teachers. Ask the teachers and they identify factors like large class sizes, training, and housing for teachers who go to rural areas. Ask community leaders and they identify a shortage of secondary schools, the need for many students to leave school to help earn family livelihoods, but also their hopes for education to improve the future prospects of their community. Almost everyone agrees that education has improved in the last few years, but that large challenges remain before education will achieve the goal of poverty reduction.

Manjacaze is a poor, rural district, 280 kilometres south of Maputo, the capital of Mozambique. It is a good place to sample what impact the PARPA (PRSP for Mozambique) is having for education in local communities. PARPA makes education a top priority for poverty reduction and has the following objectives:

- Universal education and expansion of access for every level of education, paying more attention to the promotion of gender equity; and
- Improvement in quality and relevance of teaching in order to reduce the rate of failures and dropouts.

These objectives are aligned with the Millennium Development Goals and with the Education For All Action Plan, which is an integral part of the Education Strategic Plan (PEE).

To understand how this strategy plays out at the local level, a small research project was undertaken in Maniacaze. The focus of the research was to identify what has changed in education at the local level from the year 2000 to 2004, using selected indicators. The research project covered five of the eight administrative posts in Manjacaze District: Nguzene, Nhacale, Changuala, Chalala and Manjacaze. The research consisted of 42 interviews with students of all levels, 14 teachers of different classes and districts, and leaders in education and the community.

Progress of School Admissions Between 2000-2004

"Girls that are a little bit bigger sometimes give up school to start a small business in the markets or work in the kiosks that are in the village. Most come from poor families and the only way to make a living is to engage in those activities." - Explanation offered by one teacher

Improvements in education have had the greatest impact on admissions, but fall short of universal enrolment. Of concern is the gap between enrolment and completion rates. (See table in appendix D) At the EP2 level and secondary school level, there is a shortage of schools and teachers to absorb all the students. Interviews suggest that there are also other factors that prevent some children from continuing their education, such as the need to work to help the family survive.

Number and Training of Teachers

"It is not easy to teach about 50 to 60 children in the same room, and also to pay attention to their individual needs." - An untrained teacher

With increased enrolment, the need for teachers has expanded faster than the training programs. In this district the number of untrained teachers is larger than the number of trained teachers.

Students and parents placed a high priority on having trained teachers to improve the quality of education. In response to this situation, the government has introduced a countrywide teacher-training program in parallel with the strategy to increase enrolment.

School Infrastructure

"I want to see my school with furniture since we just sit on the ground with no cement." - Grade 4 student

"I would like to see a library with books so that we can consult and research, also a laboratory for practical lessons, and also furniture for everyone. We sit on the floor." - Grade 10 student

Most of the schools in the district were built with local, conventional materials. Interviewees drew attention to the fact that there are only two secondary schools in the district as a significant issue. Field visits identified that many classes are still held in open fields, without walls or roof, which means no classes can be held during rains or strong winds.

Engaging the community in education

All children are now enrolled free of charge; this is a big factor in increased enrolment. In addition, each school has a school council and a *Ligação Escola Comunidade* (Linkage between School and Community). They encourage school attendance and help the community understand education policies and programs.

There is also a strong program of civic education being done within the communities in order to overcome cultural barriers. There is a strong belief in the area that a girl is ready for marriage when she becomes a teenager and therefore girls should spend most of their time helping on the family farm. Civic education programs are designed to help parents understand that a woman can sit at the same table and discuss crucial issues with men and take important decisions for the family, community and the country itself. That can only happen when girls are

educated. The community programs help people understand that everyone will benefit when girls are allowed to go to school.

The school councils also provide support in other ways, such as initiatives to build houses for teachers with local materials. Teachers often come from far away villages and name housing as a major concern.

Discussion

Interviewees report that significant effort is being made by all actors (government, donors, NGOs, CBOs and the local community) to improve access to education and the quality of education in the district.

Among the challenges identified by interviewees are the following:

- Need for more classrooms and teachers; between 55 and 65 students are in one classroom, especially in the EP 1 level.
- Students give up school for several reasons, including hunger, the need to get a little income for their families, and pregnancies at a young age.
- There are only two secondary schools; lack of capacity at the secondary level is the reason that education for most students ends at grade 7 or 8.
- There is a lack of school furniture in most of the schools; students sit on the ground, which makes writing difficult. Classes are interrupted for students who receive instruction outside. Rain, wind, or heat makes learning difficult with neither roof nor walls.
- Most of the teachers do not have specific training for teaching, which can affect the quality of the learning process for the children.
- Teachers often lack knowledge of the new curriculum introduced by the Ministry of Education.

Conclusion

PARPA has contributed to progress in education in the Manjacaze district of Mozambique. Significant challenges remain to achieve the goals of PARPA and the Millennium Development Goals for education. To achieve effective poverty reduction, education strategies will need to be integrated with economic development strategies for the district to remove some of the barriers for school completion and use the skills acquired by students for the benefit of the entire community.

For detailed research findings and analysis, see appendix D.

Economic well being of the poor

PRSPs were launched with the promise of change in the macro-economic framework toward something the IFIs called pro-poor growth. The problem is that there is little agreement on what constitutes pro-poor growth. Without a clearly delineated set of alternatives, the economic plan of many PRSPs resembles those of structural adjustment programs: privatization, trade liberalization, high growth and low inflation. The perception is that PRSPs have not led to substantive improvements in the economic well being of the poor in each of the countries

studied; this can be traced to short-comings in the economic strategies of the countries and also the process of implementation in the areas of agriculture, trade, and employment.

Agriculture based development

Senegal

In Senegal, like most developing countries, agriculture is an obvious choice for pro-poor economic development. Unfortunately, details on how the agriculture strategy was going to work were omitted when Senegal drafted its PRSP. Consequently the current strategy for implementation is riddled with inconsistencies.

The primary crop in Senegal is peanuts. The PRSP maintains that diversification away from peanuts is critical to economic development. Two of the crops promoted by the government are yucca and maize. The government however, has not provided transitional support to the farmers to aid the shift, nor has it heeded their desire to continue to produce peanuts rather than make the transition into niche markets like yucca that will take longer to become profitable.

The government is also failing to address competitiveness issues in agriculture in a coherent manner. Input subsidies are being provided to farmers to make the price of peanuts more competitive. The lack of infrastructure, which is a root cause of the problem, however, is not being addressed. Although input subsidies have their place, they are not a sustainable means to grow an industry. Whether farmers are producing peanuts, yucca, or maize, none of these products will become competitive in the long term without substantial investment in production related infrastructure.

The government has also attempted to formalize peanut sales by encouraging local farmers to sell to official buyers. This initiative is being thwarted by the government's own history of poor dealings with its farmers. Two years ago the government convinced farmers to sell their peanuts to official marketing structures, which issued bonds to the farmers in exchange for their peanuts. When farmers tried to cash the bonds, the buyers defaulted, resulting in massive economic losses for the farmers. Eventually the government had to intervene. This experience has cultivated mistrust between the government and the farmers. Farmers are refusing to sell to formal buyers, preferring to sell directly into the informal market.

The inconsistencies in the agricultural strategy have been decried not only by farmer and union groups but also by the opposition, who have called on the government to re-examine their agricultural strategy. To date the government has failed to do so and has ploughed ahead with prescriptive reforms, despite the evidence that the current approach is contributing to poverty rather than reducing poverty.

Ethiopia

The situation is similar in Ethiopia. Food security is broadly acknowledged to be a chronic problem in Ethiopia. Despite the government's recognition of this, civil society groups maintain that little attention is being paid to the Agricultural Led Development Plan. They report that, although the government has created a New Coalition on Food Security, little new is being done. Furthermore, the resettlement program, which forms part of the new coalition's mandate, is poorly construed. First, settlers are being sent to land that is not prepared for settlement. The land has health risks and is not suitable for irrigation. These are serious problems that

deserve deeper consideration. Part of the reason the government is able to neglect these issues is because of the lack of outside contribution to strategies such as these.

The way forward

Neither Senegal nor Ethiopia is pursuing a well thought out comprehensive strategy for agriculture. According to research done by UNDP on models of pro-poor growth in eight Asian countries, successful economic development in many agrarian societies depends on redistribution of assets to agrarian communities. It also depends on the provision of economic services (like banks) and improvement in infrastructure. Finally it depends on a shift from primary crop production to more industrialized production (either in the agriculture sector or elsewhere). Micro-enterprise development, although good for local capital generation, is not sustainable in the long term if it remains disconnected from the broader economy.

In addition, the UNDP report emphasizes the need to pursue an employment strategy that focuses on employment for poor people. It is important to acknowledge that many of the poor are youth who work to support themselves and their families. Youth face a trade-off decision between seeking further education for a better life tomorrow and the need to support themselves today. This creates a dilemma for developing country governments as well as donors supporting education: how do you generate employment for poor youth while also keeping them in school?

It is not enough to focus on different crops or different land. Pro-poor growth will depend on things like a pro-poor employment strategy, high levels of investment in roads and production facilities, as well as the provision of economic infrastructure in rural areas. It is obvious that these types of investments are very expensive. It is difficult for small donors like Canada to commit sufficient resources to these areas. Nevertheless, there are things that Canada can do.

Recommendations

1. Redistribution of wealth relies in part on adequate tax gathering and effective local redistribution channels. Through its commitment to governance, Canada can help address these issues.
2. Canada can also use its position of influence among other donors as well as at the IFI level to encourage donors to provide governments with money for infrastructure development.
3. CIDA should support either government or civil society initiatives to develop a pro-poor employment strategy, with particular attention to the tension between employment and education for young people.
4. In cases like Senegal and Ethiopia where governments are reluctant to listen to or consult their people about economic development issues CIDA needs to find appropriate ways to support civil society initiatives to engage in these discussions with their government representatives.
5. CIDA should support civil society capacity and knowledge building around economic issues.

Liberalization and Inflation

Tanzania

Liberalization has required Tanzania to open its borders to wide scale investment. One of the consequences of this investment has been increased logging. Uncontrolled logging of Tanzanian lumber is having negative impacts on the environment: namely the water table is decreasing. There appear to be no proper controls on this investment and there is a lack of consideration of the environmental consequences.

Another shortcoming identified by WV Tanzania is the lack of inclusion of women in the PRSP process, particularly at the grass roots level. Women are the primary gatherers of water and will be impacted by decreases in the water table from increased logging. If women and gender concerns had been mainstreamed into the PRSP, the full impacts of economic choices might have been considered, rather than being left unaddressed.

Research by other Tanzanian NGOs also suggests that macro-economic improvements are not reaching the poor. Traditional prescriptions, for example, emphasize lowering inflation. This is assumed to be beneficial for the poor: high inflation means people can buy less with their money. Research in Tanzania, however, reveals that, although inflation has been falling, the well being of the poor, measured in terms of the percentage of population living below the poverty line has not improved significantly, when measured against the dramatic fall in inflation (p.10).

This research points to two important facts: first, improvements in macro-indicators should not be relied on to suggest that poverty levels are decreasing. Secondly, economic analysis must identify who benefits from macro- economic reform and who loses, and ensure that the poor do not lose at the expense of those with more options. Analysis must also focus on the constraints that prevent claimed improvements from permeating throughout the population and specifically address the barriers to full participation in any benefits. In agrarian communities where much of the economy remains informal or subsistence level, macro-level price stability is not going to improve the purchasing power of the poor who do not buy much from the formal economy. Poor farmers who do sell their crops for cash income need to have increased profits for their crops; this would require prices to go up rather than down; inflation may increase rather than decrease. This would not, however, be beneficial to the urban counterparts. The problem of inflation and pro-poor growth is not easily reconciled; it requires a more nuanced approach, based on contextual analysis of the causes of poverty.

Senegal

In Senegal, the local rice industry is suffering due to cheap imports from Asia. Initially the government tried to block imports of rice. This strategy failed due to restrictions at the WTO preventing import tariffs. Therefore the government has resorted to price subsidies. At the same time however, the government has launched an initiative to position the country as the key importer of rice for West Africa. Not only is this strategy incoherent, it is also unsustainable. Price subsidies are not a long-term mechanism to address problems in competition.

The way forward

WTO regulations have severely limited the options available to developing countries to pursue economic advantages. Asian case studies show that liberalization has been beneficial for some countries, but in others it has not, particularly when cheap imports threaten to flood an entire industry. In addition, many of the Asian countries pursued policies of import substitution that

allowed them to build up their economies prior to liberalization. This option is no longer available to African countries under current WTO rules that restrict the introduction of import taxes.

For donors, this situation highlights the need to bring coherence between our aid and trade strategies.

Recommendations

1. CIDA should continue to support food security programming in developing countries.
2. The Canadian government should work to ensure that the international policy environment provides sufficient space for communities and national governments to elaborate and enact their own trade frameworks, allowing diverse pro-poor development strategies to flourish. In particular:
 - Canada must support a more robust approach to the Doha Round commitments to special and differential treatment to bring meaning to the development agenda of the trade round.
 - Canada should support developing country proposals for a special safeguard to address import surges and price volatility.
 - Canada should support the right of developing countries to self-designate a limited number of special products as key food security staples that would be exempt from tariff reductions.

Privatization

In both Mozambique and Senegal, privatization has been pursued under the PRSP. In Mozambique, privatization resulted in job losses for about 140,000 people. In Senegal, under the advisement of the IFIs, the government is pursuing the privatization of Sonocos, the peanut parastatal. This initiative was pursued without a Poverty and Social Impact Assessment (PSIA) to ensure that it was consistent with poverty reduction goals and to mitigate against any adverse consequences. A poverty impact assessment simulation was carried out by the International Development and Research Council (IDRC) and the Center for Applied Economic Research (CREA) in Dakar after the decision to privatize. The analysis suggests that privatization will likely lead to a decrease in profits for peanut farmers. This would not only increase the level of poverty for the farmers but also for households not directly dependent on farming. Meaningful poverty reduction will remain elusive without the standardization of poverty impact assessments and requisite nuanced approaches to macro-economic reform.

Recommendations

1. Canada should use its position of influence at both the national level and international level to insist on PSIA to ensure that privatization initiatives are consistent with poverty reduction strategies.
2. Where privatization is found to be the best solution, there is a need for appropriate transition and compensatory strategies for the poor.

Overall, CIDA has placed less emphasis on the economic agenda of PRSPs, preferring governance, education, health and micro-enterprise development. Consistently our partners are pointing out that the larger economic picture is a critical area of concern for them. Progress in social sectors is only sustainable in a healthy pro-poor economic environment. Despite advances made in defining the components of pro-poor growth, much of the research to date emphasizes that individual countries must come up with their own balance of initiatives that respond to their particular context. Furthermore, in the four countries under study here, the traditional economic advice seems to be running counter to pro-poor development. Thus CIDA should help governments and civil society define pro-poor growth strategies.

Recommendation

1. CIDA could support independent research into the links between the macro-economic policy decisions in these core countries and their impacts on poverty at the household level. Paralleling the UNDP study, where appropriate, the research and analysis should suggest how different models would affect variables like employment of the poor, household income, and access to wealth generating resources. In addition, the link between education, employment and economic well being could be analyzed. This research, although independent, could be carried out with the full knowledge of the government and donors. The aim of the study would be to make recommendations of alternative macro policies that might enhance pro-poor growth.

Conclusion

Two years into the PRSP process, it is clear that progress has been made in creating or reinforcing the legitimacy of a culture of citizen involvement as well as prioritizing social sectors as a means to poverty reduction. Much remains to be done to address weaknesses in governance and deepen progress on social indicators. In the economic area, there is an urgent need to focus on pro-poor growth strategies for specific country contexts and integrate social strategies into the wider economic framework. Donors must clearly recognize that social expenditures in health and education will not translate into meaningful poverty reduction without an effective economic strategy that prioritizes the needs of the poor.

Canada's international policy review provides a timely opportunity for Canada to adjust its strategy to increase the effectiveness of aid in improving the lives of the poor. The recommendations presented throughout this paper are based on the experience of our partners in Mozambique, Senegal, Tanzania and Ethiopia. They suggest practical things CIDA can do to improve aid effectiveness both generally and in country specific country contexts. In addition, Canada can use its influence on the board of the international financial institutions and at the World Trade Organization to promote fiscal and trade policies that are consistent with the poverty reduction objectives of the PRSPs.

Bibliography

- Allen, J. & Durno, J., Interview. Canadian International Development Agency. July 23, 2004.
- Bell, E., *Gender and PRSP: with experiences from Tanzania, Bolivia, Vietnam & Mozambique*. Bridge, Institute for Development Studies, University of Sussex: Denmark. 2003
- Bijlmakers, L., *Process and Impact of the PRSP in Ethiopia: A case study commissioned by Wemos*. Crystal, March 2003.
- Brief Report on the meeting made on the comments of the draft APR*. (2003). MOFED. November 28.
- Canadian International Development Agency, Cadre de Programmation 2001-2011. Cooperation Canada -Senegal. November 8, 2001.
- Canadian International Development Agency, Canada and Mozambique Country Development Programming Framework (CDPF). 2003 – 2008.
- Canadian International Development Agency, *Ethiopia Country Development Programming Framework*. Government of Canada 2004.
- Chivite, J., Interview. World Vision Mozambique. August 4, 2004
- Christian Aid, *Ignoring the Experts: Poor People's Exclusion from Poverty Reduction Strategies*. *Christian Aid Policy Briefing*. October, 2001.
- Christian Relief and Development Association, (2003). *Brief Comments on Annual Progress Report of the SDPRP*. November.
- Coyle, E., Curran, Z. & Evans, A., *PRSP Synthesis Note 7*. Department for International Development. www.prspsynthesis.org. 2003. Accessed July 9, 2004.
- Dunlop, K., Interview. Canadian International Development Agency. August 3, 1994
- Eurodad, *PRS Initiative – An Independent Evaluation of the World Bank's Support through 2004*. www.eurodad.org/articles/default.aspx?id+545&printfriendly=yes. Accessed August 3, 2004.
- Fall, M., Interview, World Vision Senegal. July 7, 2004.
- Fall, M., Interview, World Vision Senegal. August 10, 2004.
- Heidel, Klaus. *Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers – Blind to the Rights of the (working) Child?; the PRSPs' perception of child labour*. Compiled on behalf of Kindernothilfe e. V. Duisburg. Published by Kindernothilfe e.V Duisburg and Wekstattt Okonomie e. V. Heidelberg, March, 2004.

- InterAfrica Group, *Civil Society Monitoring and Evaluation of the Ethiopian PRSP: issues and options*. Note. No. 7.
- Mwakasege, C., *Making PRSP work in a Globalised Economy: The Tanzanian experience of implementing PRSP for the first two years: An NGO perspective*. Tanzania Social and Economic Trust. December 2002.
- Ministry of Finance and Economic Development, *Ethiopia: Sustainable development and poverty reduction program (SDPRP) Annual progress report (2002/03)*. December 2003.
- McKinley, T., *The Macroeconomics of Poverty Reduction: Initial Findings of the UNDP Asia-Pacific Regional Programme*. United Nations Development Program. August, 2003.
- Neufeld, K., Interview. Canadian International Development Agency (in Tanzania). August 29, 2004.
- Republic of Mozambique, *Review of the Economic and Social Plan for 2003*. March 2004.
- Oxfam International, *From Donorship to Ownership? Moving towards PRSP round two*. Briefing Paper 51. January 2004. www.oxfam.org. Accessed July 7, 2004.
- Oya C. & Weeks, J., *Investment for Poverty Reducing Employment in Africa: Review of case studies and an analytical framework*. Center for Development and Policy Research. May, 2004.
- Republic of Mozambique, Ministry of Planning and Finance. *PARPA Implementation Evaluation Report 2001*. February 2003.
- Rugelimara, Richard, Interview. World Vision Tanzania. August 12, 2004.
- United Republic of Tanzania, *Poverty Reduction Strategy: The second progress report 2001/02*. March 2003.

Appendix A: Methodology

Research Methods

The research for this paper was based on:

- In depth literature review of general and country specific material on the PRSP process from diverse sources.
- General questionnaire responses from World Vision offices involved in this study.
- In depth interviews with World Vision staff in each country.
- Interviews with CIDA staff people.

Involvement of WV national offices in national PRSP processes

Mozambique

World Vision Mozambique (WVM) has participated in the PRSP process in Mozambique through a coalition of civil society organization that includes union groups, the Mozambican debt group, religious groups and a number of other local and international NGOs. WVM has been heavily involved in the preparation of the Civil Society Annual Report as well as in the facilitation of the Poverty Observatory process in Zambezia. Through this involvement WVM has gained broad experience surrounding various areas of the PRSP.

Senegal

World Vision Senegal has been involved in the PRSP process since its beginnings in January 2001 (although at this point there was not much space for civil society participation). Since then WVS has participated in a wide variety of civil society initiatives regarding the PRSP. Initially, many of the civil society organizations involved in the process were grouped together under the leadership of the NGO/CSO coalition, CONGAD. More recently CSO/NGO groups have splintered into groups, which support the implementation of the PRSP and those whose cynicism with both the process and resulting programs has led them to oppose the PRSP. WVS has participated in initiatives from both these factions.

Tanzania

World Vision Tanzania has actively been involved in Tanzania's PRSP: national forums held by the NGO policy forum, sector-wide workshops, and seminars advocating PRSP mainstreaming. Additionally WVT has participated in experience and information exchanges related to PRSP through many formal and informal NGO networks.

Ethiopia

World Vision Ethiopia is one of 22 NGOs that has been involved in the Ethiopian NGO PRSP taskforce under the umbrella of Christian Relief and Development Associations (CRDA). Through this consortium WV has worked together with other NGOs to provided feedback and input into the PRSP process in Ethiopia from the grassroots level. WVE was also involved in the steering committee of the PRSP consultations set up by the government including those at the Woreda level.

Appendix B: Initial Research Questionnaire

Canadian Aid and the PRSP: Exploring Impacts

Introduction

World Vision Canada is undertaking a review of CIDA's aid strategy, Strengthening Aid Effectiveness. In this strategy CIDA chose to focus its aid in a group of core countries and target its interventions around the objectives identified in the national Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP). In September 2004, this policy will be reviewed. WVC is taking this opportunity to offer CIDA feedback on its approach based on the experience of several national offices.

CIDA's choice to focus funding on the priority areas of the PRSP may have advantages and disadvantages. The purpose of the WVC review of this approach is to provide the Canadian government with feedback on the strengths and weaknesses of a PRSP focussed approach to aid. WVC would like to ensure the CIDA policies respond to the needs of the countries World Vision works in. As a result, WVC would like field offices to provide input based on their experience with the PRSP and CIDA.

We would like to request your feedback on the questions below. Our objective is to learn about issues that have surfaced in the development and implementation of the PRSP that are important for the people in your country, as well as important for World Vision programs. The survey below is intended as an initial fact gathering exercise. We will follow up with you to gather a more in-depth understanding once we receive your initial response. As the timeline for this project is short, we request that you fill out this questionnaire before July 13.

Please simply type your responses to the questions below under the question and return the questionnaire to ydnewp2003@yahoo.ca. Thanks you so much for your help and I look forward to speaking with you soon.

Wendy Phillips

Questions

- 1) How has your World Vision office been involved in the PRSP process? Who among the staff are familiar with the PRSP, have had discussion with others about the PRSP and / or used the PRSP in program design, monitoring and evaluation, working with the government, etc.?
- 2) What local issues have been most important in the PRSP or other poverty reduction discussions?
- 3) Of these issues, which has been the most important and why?
- 4) How has World Vision been involved in the issue? (participating in meetings, program development, etc)
- 5) What other organizations have been involved in this issue?
- 6) How has this issue impacted the people of your country and/or the people in World Vision programs? Please describe a story or incident that illustrates the impact of the PRSP.
- 7) What has been the impact of the PRSP on WV programming – has your office been involved in implementing or monitoring PRSP initiatives?

- 8) Was there any area that was neglected in the PRSP which has resulted in adverse consequences for development efforts in your country or in the program work of WV?
- 9) Have you noticed any change in your relationship with CIDA (in terms of aid given, program or policy discussions with CIDA and PSU officials) as a result of the PRSP?
- 10) Overall, has the impact of the PRSP on development efforts been positive or negative, and why?
- 11) Is there a specific area (such as literacy, education, rural livelihoods, food security etc) where the impact of the PRSP on development is particularly evident?
- 12) One of the consequences of CIDA's aid effectiveness strategy is to work directly with national governments rather than NGOs. Do you see this as positive or negative? Please give an example to illustrate your response.

Appendix C

Tanzania's PRSP and Education: People's Participation and Increased Quality

Research done by Annamarie K. Kiaga

Background and Context

Social, economic and political development in the post-independence Tanzania has suffered a triad of interrelated burdens – poverty, disease and ignorance. Over the years, Tanzania invested heavily in welfare-oriented strategies to improve the quality of life of its people, which included universal primary education (UPE) and community-based primary health care. While the 1970's witnessed improvements in education, health and provision of other social services, the success period was short-lived. Caught in the international economic depression of the early 1980's, the country experienced severe macro-economic difficulties that, in turn, led to an overall deterioration in public services. IMF and World Bank structural adjustment policies were then adopted with the aim of phasing out welfare-oriented policies so as to enable a market-oriented economy, perceived to be the answer to the incumbent economic crisis. In education, for example, structural adjustment policies called for cost sharing, for withdrawal of government support for the public education system, and for the increase of private sector in education. Controversy surrounds the success and/or failure of this change of policies. The fact is that even after two decades of embracing the neoliberal economic policy, approximately one-third of Tanzanians are living in abject poverty, about twenty nine percent cannot read or write in any language, and more people are suffering from what would otherwise be preventable diseases.

At the turn of the century, Tanzania embarked on a number of complementary policy initiatives aimed at tackling poverty and other development issues, especially education. They are summarized in the table below.

Tanzania: The Policy Planning Process	
Policy Planning Initiative	Objective
Vision 20025	National vision of economic and social objectives to be attained by the year 2025
National Poverty Eradication Strategy (NPES)	National strategy and objectives for poverty eradication efforts through 2010
Tanzania Assistance Strategy (TAS)	Medium-term national strategy of economic and social development, encompassing joint efforts of government and the international community
Poverty Reduction Strategy Plan (PRSP)	Medium-term strategy of poverty reduction, developed through broad consultation with national and international stakeholders, in the context of the enhanced Highly Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC) Initiative

Building Blocks

Policy reforms aimed at ensuring macroeconomic stability and market efficiency, being supported partly by the IMF and the World Bank under the Poverty Reduction Growth facility (PRGF) and the Programmatic Structural Adjustment Credit (PSAC-I), respectively.

Reform of the public sector (including central and local government), being supported under PRGF, PSAC-I, and Public Service Reform Programme (PSRC) and by other initiatives supported by the international partners. Development of sector-specific strategies, being supported by many international partners.

Adopted from Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP), October 2000.

In general, these initiatives articulate the current agenda for the country's socio-economic development. With attaining a high quality livelihood for all Tanzanians as the overall goal, the country strives to:

- Attain a high rate of economic growth and build a strong, diversified, resilient and competitive economy
- Satisfy basic needs, eradicating poverty and attaining economic and social justice
- Promote good governance, democracy, rule of law, integrity and moral uprightness
- Ensure sustainability of the development endeavour, on an intergenerational basis
- Achieve the highest level of ingenuity, self-confidence and self-esteem (URT, 2000).

It is in this context that the government of Tanzania adopted a number of education reforms.

Poverty Reduction Strategy Plan and the Education Sector

Provision of quality education in Tanzania currently overrides all other concerns for poverty reduction in the country. This is more apparent in Tanzania's Vision 2025, which emphasizes creative, innovative, high-quality education in order to respond to development challenges and build a culture of self-development and entrepreneurship, especially amongst youth (Vision 2025 p. 19).

Since the introduction of PRSP, the education sector has undergone a number of changes. The main goal is to improve equality of access to education, regardless of geographic location, income, age, gender and physical ability. To this end, the government, in 2002, designed and began to implement the Primary Education Development Plan (PEDP) within the Education Sector Development Program (ESDP) process. A four year program, PEDP aims at expanding enrolments, improving the quality of education through improvements in the school environment and available resources, enhancing local people's participation in education, and strengthening financial availability and management for schools. Strategies to achieve these goals include:

- Abolishing all school fees and mandatory contributions for primary education;
- Improving Standard I enrolments, recruiting additional teachers, and building more classrooms and sanitation facilities;
- Democratizing school committees by improving their composition and functioning through, among other things, a provision of USD 500 per school for training;
- Mainstreaming gender concerns;
- Undertaking information, education and communication (IEC) programs with emphasis on local participation in education; and
- Establishing a capitation grant of USD 10 per enrolled child for quality improvements at school level

According to the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP), a framework building on Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) (2000/1 – 02/03) and the recent PRS review, there have been tangible improvements in education quality indicators. In three years of implementing PEDP, total enrolments have soared, gender parity in enrolment has improved, transition from primary to secondary schools has increased, and more local people participate in education. This study was therefore designed to see what impact these changes are having at the local level, in rural as well as urban schools.

The Study

In order to get a sense of whether or not the increase in number of students has gone hand in hand with increased quality of education as anticipated by the PRSP, a rural field study was undertaken. Since PRSP has been operational for at least two years, it was hypothesized that the local population will have knowledge of its existence and be able to identify a number of ways the strategy has impacted their lives, in particular with regards to primary education. With the above hypothesis in mind, the community- based research was designed to reflect a Knowledge-Perception-Experience study whereby research questions will elicit the knowledge, perceptions/attitudes and actual experiences of the local population. Three broad questions were investigated at the school and household level:

1. Is the community familiar with PRSP and other related initiatives, especially with regard to education?
2. Can the community identify ways in which PRSP impacted primary education in their locality?
3. What is the community perception of what is being done, and what ought to be done in order to increase and maintain high quality education for both boys and girls?

Overall, the study was designed to be an ethnographic exploration of the issues of education quality and gender as they relate to education in the PRSP. Semi-structured in-depth interviews were used. In addition to on-site interviews, informal interviews with WVT staff were conducted. Secondary/Tertiary data was collected in consultation with the WVT staff at the headquarters, and with other organizations working on poverty reduction in the country. These include the Vice President's Office (VPO), Research and Poverty Alleviation (REPOA), Economic and Social research Foundation (ESRF), United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and the Ministry of Education.

One week was spent in Handeni district, in Tanga region. With the help of Mzungu ADP staff, the researcher visited three villages, Mzungu, Gendagenda and Mumbwi, and had an opportunity to talk to several members of the schools in the respective villages. These include the chairperson of the Gendagenda school committee, who happens to be the village chairperson, one former student of the school, and two health providers in the village. In Mzungu, it was not possible to meet with a member of the school committee or teachers, but two recent graduates of the school provided information. Fortunately, Mzungu and Mumbwi are some of the many schools that benefit from the WVT Mzungu ADP; therefore, information on their progress is available at the ADP offices. At Mumbwi we talked to one member of the teaching staff.

Main Findings

Since the introduction of the PSRP and Primary Education Development Plan (PEDP), Handeni district has witnessed tremendous improvement in the provision of basic education. In the section below, these improvements are discussed under the subheadings: access, quality, local people's participation, and local people's perceptions of education.

Access

According to WVT Mzundu ADP, where records of 27 primary schools in the district are closely monitored, major improvements in enrolments have been recorded in 2004. For example, in Mzundu, enrolments for standard I soared from 70 to 160 in 2003, 190 in 2004, and it is expected to increase to 210 pupils in 2005. Part of the reason lies in the abolition of school fees and other mandatory contributions, and the other part on law enforcement. More parents are now able to bring their children to school because they do not have to pay school fees and books are available at their schools. As far as law enforcement is concerned, teachers are reportedly more willing to keep records of the pupils' attendance and absences. Improvement in attendance has been associated with the involvement of more parents in monitoring the progress of their children and also by legal action taken against parents who neglect warnings of absenteeism among their children.

In addition to abolition of school fees, access to primary education has been improved through increasing the number of schools and increasing the numbers of classrooms in existing schools. In Handeni, a total of 72 classes were built in 22 schools over a period of one year, since 2003. Today the number of classrooms available is still not enough for the increasing number of enrolled students.

The dominant concern in community discussions, however, is access into secondary schools. Two issues were brought up in this regard. One is the fact that the number of secondary schools placed in the region determines enrolment into secondary school, and the other is the government decision to reduce boarding facilities at secondary schools in order to reduce costs. Having only three secondary schools, concerns over the limited number of students that can be absorbed were aired. The issue was strongly discussed in Gendagenda, where only one student passed his Standard VII exam in 2003, yet failed to secure a place in secondary school. Lack of boarding facilities is said to make placement even harder for those pupils from remote villages.

As far as gender parity is concerned, there were no major differences in enrollment into Standard I. For example, in Gendagenda, where records of all 7 and 8 years olds were available, it was determined that all eligible girls and boys were enrolled for entry in 2005. This is not to say that the number of boys does not exceed that of girls. Rather, there is no reason to believe that the increased enrollments discriminated against gender. There were concerns, however, over retention of schoolgirls, especially as it relates to early pregnancies. It was reported that the average class in which most girls were dismissed for pregnancy was Standard IV, in which case their average age is 10 years old. More prominent in Mumbwi than the other two villages, early pregnancies were related to extensive adult illiteracy and social expectations for children, to which parents still adhere. Marriage is one of them; employment and having children are the others. Without educating the parents on the importance of education above all these, it was argued, parents continue to emphasize these milestones for their children, creating a dilemma for young people. The government directive on lowering the age at which girl children start school may be part of the solution. The other part will have to do with increased knowledge about the importance of a formal education among local people. The later can only be achieved, however, if education becomes more relevant to the local needs, a goal that can be achieved through increased community involvement in education.

Another important determinant of retention, or lack thereof, has been the availability of lunchtime meals in schools. It was found that the provision of lunch meals is closely related to the distance children have to walk to school, their age, and the ability of their families to provide other meals during the day. The challenge facing Gendagenda primary school was more instructive in this issue: how can it equitably serve children from the three villages surrounding it? The children from the two villages a little further from Gendagenda have to walk at least two

kilometers to attend the school. This, it was argued, is one of the main reasons for the low retention level at the school. With the help of the school committee, a program is underway to provide lunch meals at the school. However, due to the food insecurity, most parents did not participate in the program in 2004. Raising money for this initiative has also failed, mainly for the same reasons.

Shortage of teachers prevents the establishment of satellite schools or classes in the respective villages. The only secondary school educated man, who could potentially help in this respect, has a hard time deciding whether or not he should volunteer to teach the young kids in one of the villages and forfeit the survival of his own family.

Quality

It was found that the improvements¹ in education, mainly in terms of infrastructure and teaching resources, have not necessarily translated into improvements in quality of education, measured, as it is, in qualification of teachers and primary school pass rates, as well as the number of pupils per teacher, classroom, and textbooks. Reasons varied from one village to another. In general, issues of adult illiteracy, lack of teachers, lack of coordination and absence of hostels, especially for secondary school students, were raised.

Most villagers, it was agreed, recognize the importance of regular school attendance by their children, and participated in making by-laws to the effect. However, with extensive adult illiteracy, it is hard for the parents to follow up on the child's school activities². In one reported incident, for example, a number of parents whose children were continuously recorded as absent were taken to a local civil court. As part of his plea for innocence, one parent revealed that his lack of reading or writing skills prevented him from recognizing even the dates on his children's exercise books, let alone understanding the subject matter in them. The literacy gap between generations, therefore, has the potential to limit the knowledge transferred to the children and their ability to transcend the economic and social standards of their parents. At the community level, an ability to use available resources for greater productivity may be as important for poverty reduction as access to more resources.

Although country-wide there has been a major expansion in the number of new teachers trained and recruited, along with transfers of many teachers to schools with a teacher shortage (URT, 2002), the changes in the three villages in this study were not substantial. In Gendagenda, where the need is more acute, only three more teachers have been added over three years of PEDP. Notably, the government has tried to transfer teachers there, but poor living and working conditions result in teachers requesting transfers as soon as they get to the village. In Mumbwi, the number of teachers has increased to eight, while in Mzundu the number stands at twelve. With enrolment in Standard I alone ranging from 90 to 210, these schools cannot boast of improved teacher/pupil ratio. It is no wonder, therefore, that these schools have a meagre increase in the number of students passing their Standard VII exams. There was not enough evidence to make any concrete conclusions as to whether or not there have been any changes in the curriculum.

Another aspect related to the quality of education, particularly in Mzundu, has been lack of coordination. This manifests itself in two aspects. One aspect involves the government whose

¹ With schools closed for the end of the year breaks, it was not possible, in Mumbwi and Gendagenda villages, to obtain detailed quantitative data on the progress made, and hence the lack of concrete comparisons among the schools. Efforts to obtain such indicators produced only estimates, except for Mzundu School whose data is maintained at Mzundu ADP.

² Extensive adult literacy in Handeni district was said to be closely related to the preference, among Muslims, for Koranic schools. The presence of Muslims in the district is approximated at 90%.

decisions made at the central level often duplicated those of non-governmental organization working in the local areas with the people. For example, in several schools, NGO's had already built classrooms to meet local needs. However, at the onset of PEDP, more classrooms were built without taking into consideration the existing needs. As a result, some schools have more classes than they need while others are still demanding more classes.

Such lack of flexibility on the part of government programs is also reflected in the issues concerning availability of teachers, cutting across all three schools, Mzundu, Gendagenda and Mumbwi. Reportedly, teacher absenteeism has worsened since the government's call to teachers to improve their training. The Grade B teachers spend most of their time studying for exams that will promote them to Grade A and diploma qualification. In Gendagenda, teacher absenteeism comes with a twist. The government's centralized system of paying teacher salaries is in question here. With only a train that passes through the village once in each direction as the main means of transportation, teachers have been known to be absent for weeks at a time, as they go to the district council office to collect their salaries and wait for the train to return.

Local people's participation

Participation of citizens in governing education is an important part of the Poverty Reduction Strategy. This participation is envisioned to include leadership in various capacities. Various researchers (exemplars include Lange, 2004) have found, however, that there is a tendency among local leaders to see their role as simply carrying out government instructions instead of listening to and serving people (TEN/MET, 2003). This study encountered such tendencies. In Mumbwi the question of the number of teachers per pupil was raised. During the discussion it was revealed that there were two Grade B teachers willing to teach at the school, but the local government prevented them, citing lack of money to pay their salaries. Asked about the PEDP money, the teacher replied that most of the money comes with special instructions of how it should be used and the school failed to find a way to transfer use of the funds, to take advantages of local resources. This contradicts the envisioned role of the school committee, in which they are supposed to "prepare whole school development ... that are intended to enable schools to make their own decisions about the development of their school. This enables each school to make use of local expertise from amongst their communities, pupils, and teachers about what is best for them" (TEN/MET, 2003).

Adult illiteracy is also identified as a barrier for local participation. Concerns over parent's ability to make informed decisions were invariably voiced in interviews in the three villages. As such, even though parents are called to attend meetings concerning their schools, very few attend. Since it is likely that literate parents would invest more in educating their children and take an active part in improving the quality of their school, it is important that emphasis on primary education goes hand in hand with adult literacy.

Other reasons for limited attendance included farm work, lack of understanding of the significance of their presence, and experiences at previous meetings when parents did not have enough chance to air their grievances or where their grievances went unattended.

An issue of accountability was observed, rather than raised during the study. In Gendagenda, it was observed that the school committee chairperson was also the village chairperson. A number of issues can be raised with such an arrangement. First, the school committee is supposed to be accountable to the public, through first and foremost the village council, where the village chairperson is also the chair. With one person chairing both, a conflict of interest is likely to arise and that there can be no checks and balances between the different levels of governance. Second, there is a chance that too much decision-making is left with one person, especially if it involves representation in the district and national levels. It was not certain why

this arrangement was made in Gendagenda, but it does have implications for the democratization of school governance. As such, it may be important to revise the guidelines for school committees in a way that clearly defines the roles each member has to the committee and to the village.

People's perceptions of education

In a recent report on perceptions of PEDP, Lange (2004) reports that, of a total of 1,260 respondents in six councils, 70 percent were satisfied with primary education. However, the satisfaction was based on improvements in infrastructure and abolition of school fees, rather than quality of education. In this study, there was no question that people are more concerned with poverty eradication than anything else. To reduce poverty in rural areas, they stated, concerted efforts are needed that go beyond the education sector. Economic opportunities, access to credit, knowledge and skills appropriate for agricultural enterprises are some of the needs voiced. Until their children can have these opportunities, they argue, it is hard for them to perceive that they are getting good quality education. "It should be able to open up such opportunities, otherwise what is the difference between being educated and not being educated," added one of the student respondents. What seems to be accepted by many is that this is an opportune time to send your child to school because future prospects look promising.

Although the study could not establish without a doubt the extent to which teaching materials were available in the three schools visited, the discussions that ensued implied a number of books were made available over the past few years. The quality of such materials could not be established.

Challenges and Conclusions

Despite the importance of the many issues raised in other villages, it is in Gendagenda that issues pertinent to the impact of education in poverty reduction were raised. It is here that the cycle of poverty was made more visual. With a lack of reliable transportation, the village has been unable to engage in any concrete income generating activities. The extent of their involvement has been a few young people venturing into the vast Saadani game reserve to catch game or crossing it into Pangani for sea products. Several attempts to collect the large amount of mangoes in and around the village for sale in Tanga and other regions have also failed, due to unreliability of the train. As such, the circulation of money is very small, being dependent on twenty-five adults with reliable salaried income. In 2004, the village committee failed to raise TZS 600,000 to start a village bank account as one of the main requirements of the government before it can disburse developmental funds.

Also related to the remoteness of this village is the lack of social services. This village, established since 1977, has had no health services and no reliable water source. Currently, the village has about 360 households, with 880 adults. According to the health aides, the village has 300 children under five years old. Until three years ago, the school consisted of badly built three rooms and no sanitation facilities. Teachers have known to come and leave with the first available train, once they learn of the poor living conditions for them. It is with great honor that they speak of the four teachers available today. With new built classrooms and toilets, villagers see hope for their children, but many challenges remain.

Challenges

Major changes in education await the children attending their primary school in this century. For the education to be more meaningful to their livelihoods, however, a number of challenges need to be met, within the formal school system and outside it. A number of suggestions follow:

Reaching remote schools

The government is challenged to reach out more intensively to the remote schools - decreasing distances that children have to walk to school, increasing the number of teachers and the overall living conditions of the villages in which these schools are located. It was suggested that income-generating activities be addressed in conjunction with the schools to encourage stronger links between the community and the school and greater community ownership for the welfare of the school.

Girls retention and gender concerns

The biggest challenge is to modify the gendered division of labor and perceptions associated with what role girls and boys can play in society. It was suggested that part of the formal education programs implemented by the PSRP, like provision of text and reference books, and non-formal education be dedicated to working with the people to transform perceptions about gender equity. The curriculum should eliminate activities that identify specific gender roles.

Employment opportunities

While at this stage it is important to improve the well being of a girl child whose opportunities for employment and other income generating activities has lagged behind, it is as important to make sure such opportunities still exist for the boy child. It is suggested that education needs to empower each child to confidently take its place in society regardless of gender. An important step that needs to be taken in this regard is to include more life skills in the curriculum.

Living and working conditions of teachers

Children learn by examples. Without satisfaction among the teachers, due to their deteriorating living and working conditions, there little hope in improving the quality of education. It is recommended that efforts to revamp the quality of primary and secondary education go hand in hand with the improvement in teaching and living conditions of teachers. A positive step towards this might be to set aside a capitation grant for support of teachers.

Increasing the number of teachers

One option for increasing the number of teachers might be initiatives to encourage some of the unemployed graduates to become teachers. Such a move will not only close the gap between number of teachers and available students but will also decrease the burden of unemployment among youths. With a capitation grant as an incentive, more graduates might be convinced to take up teaching careers, with on-the-job training to improve their teaching skills.

Role of key stakeholders

Although it is understood that the whole community has a stake in education, it is still not clear how each stakeholder is to relate to the task of improving education. More specific definitions of the roles of each stakeholder need to be drawn and discussed with communities in order to ensure smooth and productive governance of education in the country, and ownership among villagers.

Overall Improvements

There are obvious differences in economic and social needs from one area to another. It is recommended that educational resources be designed to accommodate these diverse needs in order to make education relevant to the local needs of the people.

Conclusion

The picture of successful outcomes towards improving education quality and poverty reduction in Tanzania, painted by the report on PSRP, is laudable. However, it is a picture clouded by situated inequities, irrelevance to problems of the local people, and inability to change people's perceptions of education. If improvement in education quality and gender parity in the context of poverty reduction has taken place, it is riddled with unevenness and inequalities among regions. Poverty reduction initiatives need to be flexible enough to take into consideration geographic factors and allow for a variety of strategies that address local circumstances. The need is well conveyed in the final comments of Ramadhani, who has two children: "I need skills for agricultural production and entrepreneurship in these harsh conditions. If they are lucky, our children will do better than us. Until then, they need to master these surroundings."

References:

- Buchert, L. 1994. Education in the Development of Tanzania, 1919-1990. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: Mkuki na Nyota.
- Lange, S. 2004. Primary Education Since the Introduction of the Primary Education Development Plan. Research on Poverty Alleviation (REPOA)'s Formative Process Research on the Local Government Reform in Tanzania. Project Brief No. 8. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: REPOA.
- Makongo, J. 2003. Implementation of the Primary Education Development Plan: Are We Achieving our Goals? HakiElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.2. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- Makongo, J. & M. Mbilinyi. 2003. The Challenge of Democratizing Education Governance at the Local Level. HakiElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.9. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- Makongo, J. & R. Rajani. 2003. The Power of Information for School Governance: The HakiElimu Experience. HakiElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.1. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- Masanja, V. 2003. Bridging the Gender gap in Science and Mathematics Education. HakiElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.10. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- Mbilinyi, M. 2003. Equity, Justice and Transformation in Education: The Challenge of Mwalimu Nyerere Today. HakiElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.5. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- Rajani, R. 2003. Is primary Education heading in the Right Direction? Thinking with Nyerere. HakiElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.4. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- Rajani, R.(Ed.). 2004. Key Principles for every School Committee. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- Rajani, R. & G. Omondi. 2003. The Primary Education Development Plan (PEDP): A Summary. HakiElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.6. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- Rajani, R. & S. Sumra. 2003. Is Extra Funding for Primary Education making a Difference? Conceptual and Measurement Challenges. HakiElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.3. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- Sumra, S. 2003. Implementation of the Primary Education Development Plan: Voices from the Community. HakiElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.7. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- Tanzania Education Network (TEN/MET). 2003. School Committee Capacity development: Lessons from Civil Society Organizations. HakiElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.8. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: HakiElimu.
- United Nations Children's Funds (UNICEF). 2001. Situation Analysis of Children in Tanzania. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: UNICEF.
- United Republic of Tanzania (URT). 1993. The Tanzania Education System for the 21st Century. Report of the Task Force. Ministry of Education and Culture and Ministry of Science, Technology and Higher Education. Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania: MOECC/MSTHE.

Appendix D

Case Study: Education and PRSP in Manjacaze, Mozambique

Research done by Jaime Chivite and Alcino Moiane

Introduction

Manjacaze is a poor, rural district, 280 kilometres south of Maputo, the capital of Mozambique. It is a good place to sample what impact the PARPA (PRSP for Mozambique) is having for education in local communities. PARPA makes education a top priority for poverty reduction and has the following objectives:

- a) Universal education and expansion of access for every level of education, paying more attention to the promotion of gender equity; and
- b) Improvement in quality and relevance of teaching in order to reduce the rate of failures and dropouts. These objectives are aligned with the Millennium Development Goals and with the Education For All Action Plan, which is an integral part of the Education Strategic Plan (PEE).

To understand how this strategy plays out at the local level, a small research project was undertaken in Maniacaze. The focus of the research was to identify what has changed in education at the local level from the year 2000 to 2004, using selected indicators. The research project covered five of the eight administrative posts in Manjacaze District: Nguzene, Nhacale, Changuala, Chalala and Manjacaze. The research consisted of 42 interviews with students of all levels and 14 teachers of different classes and districts. In addition, interviews were conducted with Mr. Paulo Langa, the District Education Director, Mr. Fernando Mondlane, the Chief of Planning at the district education office, Mr. Manque, the World Vision Program Manager for that region, a director of an elementary school, and 8 people from the community.

Progress of School Admissions Between 2000-2004

“Girls that are a little bit bigger sometimes give up school to start a small business in the markets or work in the kiosks that are in the village. Most come from poor families and the only way to make a living is to engage in those activities.”

- Explanation offered by one teacher

Improvements in education have had the greatest impact on admissions, but fall short of universal enrolment. At the EP2 level and secondary school level, there is a shortage of schools and teachers to absorb all the students. Interviews suggest that there are also other factors that prevent some children from continuing their education, such as the need to work to help the family survive.

The table below indicates that the number of admissions for girls and boys in the Elementary Program 1 (EP1) has not changed substantially, but there has been a significant increase in enrolment in EP2 and Secondary School from 2000 to 2004. Comparing the three levels of education, we notice a significant decrease of the admission numbers from EP1 to EP2 in each of the years, and the same pattern occurs from EP2 to secondary school.

Within the schools covered by this research, we also compared the number of girls admitted with the number of boys. At each level, the number of girls is about 40 – 45% of the number of boys, indicating that there are still significant barriers for girls to attend school.

Table 1: Annual progress of school admissions in EP1, EP2, Secondary School

Year	EP1			EP2			Secondary School		
	Girls	Boys	Total Year	Girls	Boys	Total Year	Girls	Boys	Total year
2000	16.784	35.042	51.826	1.665	3.823	5.488	444	969	1.413
2001	16.702	34.713	51.415	1.607	4.675	5.282	632	1.343	1.975
2002	16.961	35.192	52.153	2.644	5.531	8.175	690	1.479	2.169
2003	16.906	35.437	52.343	2.915	6.340	9.255	1.072	2.263	3.335
2004	17.387	35.947	53.331	3.242	6.797	10.039	1.336	2.864	4.200
Total	84.740	176.338	261.063	12.076	27.166	38.239	4.174	8.918	13.092

Source: Education District Office of Manjacaze

Number and Training of Teachers

"It is not easy to teach about 50 to 60 children in the same room, and also to pay attention to their individual needs."

- Response from one untrained teacher

There are two groups of teachers, one with appropriate training (trained) and the other without any training (untrained). The table below illustrates the increase in the number of teachers in order to cover the growth in school enrolment. Because of the rapid growth, the government is obliged to recruit teachers without any training,

As the result of this recruitment, the number of non-trained teachers is larger than the number of trained teachers. In response to the need for training, the government is implementing a countrywide teacher-training program in parallel with the strategy to increase enrolment.

Students and parents placed a high priority on having trained teachers to improve the quality of education. Increasing the number of trained teachers is one strategy to improve education in this district.

Table 2: Annual progress in growth of teachers from EP1, EP2, Secondary School in Manjacaze District.

Year	EP1		Secondary School	
	Trained	Untrained	Trained	Untrained
2000	183	278	17	12
2001	192	281	20	12
2002	263	277	26	12
2003	258	379	15	32
2004	253	387	9	65

Source: Education District Office of Manjacaze

The large increase in the number of teachers in 2002 can be explained by the increase in the number of classrooms built in the same year (see table 3). The numbers in EP1 reflect that the effort to train teachers has been targeted to this level. Although much remains to be done, there is progress. The same does not apply for the secondary school level where the number of trained teachers has been decreasing in the last three years. Statistics that compare trained and untrained teachers were not obtained for EP2.

School Infrastructures in Manjacaze District

"I want to see my school with furniture since we just sit on the ground with no cement.
- Grade 4 student

"I would like to see a library with books so that we can consult and research, also a laboratory for practical lessons, and also furniture for everyone. We sit on the floor."
- Grade 10 student

When asked what they would like to see improved, most students identified basic things, like desks and trained teachers. Most of the schools in the district were built with local, conventional materials. Interviewees drew attention to the fact that there are only two secondary schools in the district as a significant issue. Field visits identified that many classes are still held in open fields, without walls or roof, which means no classes can be held during rains or strong winds.

The number of classrooms in the table below covers all levels, EP1, EP2 and Secondary Schools. The results of the efforts to invest in school infrastructure in Manjacaze can be seen in 2002 and 2004, but, according to what we observed in the field, many pupils are still having their lessons outside in open area schools. Before 2000 the whole Manjacaze district had only one secondary school; in 2003 one more school started in Chidueguele. That helps to explain the large increase in the number of Secondary School students in that year.

Table 3: Annual progress growth of school infrastructures

Type of School infrastructure	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	Total
Classrooms	15	15	27	12	41	110
Residences for teachers	-	1	3	3	4	11
School offices	2	3	7	4	9	25
Improved toilets	5	9	19	6	34	73

Discussion

Interviewees report that significant effort is being made by all actors (government, donors, NGOs, CBOs and the local community) to improve access to education and the quality of education in the district. In addition to the indicators reflected in the numbers, it is important to note that the strategy included the introduction of various mobilization efforts for parents, to help them understand the importance of education for their children and encourage enrolment.

Policies to engage the community in education

From 2005 on, all children from grade 1 to 7 (EP1 and EP2) are enrolled free of charge. This allows a large number of children to have access to education without economic cost barriers. It helps to explain the increased enrolment in EP2 and secondary school.

Two important structures were created within each school: School Council and a *Ligação Escola Comunidade* (Linkage between School and Community), which brings together the teachers, parents, local community leaders and students. The major role of these two bodies is to mobilize and encourage the community, by helping them understand education policies and programs, and also by participating in the school management process. Education is accepted as a crucial area to reduce poverty and as a first priority area for the PRSP.

There is also a strong program of civic education being done within the communities in order to overcome the cultural barriers. There is a strong belief in the area that a girl is ready for marriage when she becomes a teenager and therefore girls should spend most of their time helping on the family farm. Civic education programs are designed to help parents understand that a woman can sit at the same table and discuss crucial issues with men and take important decisions for the family, community and the country itself. That can only happen when girls are educated. The community programs help people understand that everyone will benefit when girls are allowed to go to school.

The school councils provide support in other ways, such as initiatives to build houses for teachers with local materials. Teachers often come from far away villages and they name housing as an important issue. Although the houses are often not high quality, it is better than nothing for incoming teachers.

Constraints and Challenges for Education in Manjacaze District

Following is a list of challenges identified during the interviews and field visits:

- Lack of school infrastructure; between 55 and 65 students are in one classroom, especially in the EP 1 level.
- Shortage of housing for teachers who come from far away villages.
- Students give up school for several reasons, including hunger. Children are encouraged to run small businesses to get a little income for their families or to support a young brother in case of orphans; some are required to go to the family farm to survive. Others live in orphanages because parents have passed away due to HIV/AIDS. Pregnancies are another reason for leaving school.
- The learning process is slow, especially in grade 1(EP1), due to the language barrier (Portuguese). A new curriculum introduced this year is designed to address this problem.
- For EP1 and EP2 there is a lack of libraries and learning materials for practical experience in some subjects.
- There are only two secondary schools that cannot absorb the great number of students that transit from grade 7 to 8; lack of capacity at the secondary level is the reason that the education of most students ends at grade 7 or 8.
- There is a lack of school furniture in most of the schools; students sit on the ground, which makes writing difficult.
- Most of the teachers do not have specific training for teaching, which can affect the quality of the learning process for the children.
- Teachers often lack knowledge of the new curriculum introduced by the Ministry of Education.
- Most of the children do not have an official birth registration; this is a constraint for these children to access available benefits.
- All the pupils who receive their lessons outside of classrooms do not have classes in the rain season, or when there is strong heat or wind, since most of the classrooms have neither roof nor walls.

Conclusion

PARPA has contributed to progress in education in the Manjacaze district of Mozambique. Significant challenges remain to achieve the goals of PARPA and the Millennium Development Goals for education. To achieve effective poverty reduction, education strategies will need to be integrated with economic development strategies for the district to remove some of the barriers for school completion and use the skills acquired by students for the benefit of the entire community.

